

8<sup>TH</sup> HUMBLE SUBMISSION

Each chapter is a different scenario but in continuity of the '*Judges & Generals in Pakistan*' Vol I - IV and travelling through '*The Living History of Pakistan*' Vol I - III making this book the 8<sup>TH</sup> Volume of Pakistan's contemporary history.

So, these books, including this '*The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV*' are compilation of facts from the contemporary history, may be irritating for many because the truth is often bitter; explaining diverse state of affairs. This volume, like Vol-III, is also treating with years from around 2013 till 2016 of KARACHI metropolis of Pakistan only.

No fiction or fabrication - this book, like the previous ones, may be taken as reference based on authentic news, editorials, opinions and criticisms on issues connected with mega city of Karachi – and with sources.

The truth is that most end users are just not that interested in the details that drive quality in research and reference work.

It is well known fact now that a substantial number of people offer opinions on fictitious topics in the fictitious way. The results of the most fictitious public affairs issues suggest that people give opinions on such matters in large part because of the pressure to answer survey questions – which ultimately ends with bogus results prepared at the office tables on the '*need and urgency basis*'.

John H. Murphy of The University of Texas mentions in his research paper '*Advances in Consumer Research*' Volume 11, 1984; pp 52-55 wrote:

*"Hence, authors are to be commended on their efforts to bring attention to and to investigate this source of measurement error. However, an evaluation of some of the underlying premises of their methodologies suggests that their studies and resulting conclusions may be misleading [so authors should avoid the pitfalls]."*

Thus, this volume, like my other books on contemporary history of Pakistan contains no misleading intelligence story, no distracting investigative report, no concocted interview and no feed from the 'concerned ones' - yet every page seems innovative; no fiction in this book but simple narration of facts. As I quote in the beginning of each volume:

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

*'It is the collection of tragedies and misgivings which are deliberately buried in suspicious darkness of political compromises and narration of lust, corruption, egoism, insensitivity and selfishness of ruling few whose families are settled abroad. They only go to Pakistan to [mis]govern when their turn ripens up.*

*I've simply excavated those facts; collated and placed the same together for those who want to keep a track of Pakistan's past.'*

You read your newspaper daily and regularly; many of you go through it thoroughly but you do not keep record of even important events. This book contains nothing but the true events and analysis on certain topics, of course, which have cogent references to your history, your representatives, your leadership, your ideal guides and not the least, your nation - your country, the Pakistan.

Referring to the *'Daily times'* dated 21<sup>st</sup> October 2004, Lt Gen (rtd) Moeenuddin Haider once highlighted security and terrorism issues and said:

*'The United States should be cursed for abandoning jihadis after using them for its interests in the region. During the 'holy war' in Afghanistan in 1980, America had patronised 35,000 to 40,000 Arab militants but it did not develop the area after defeating Russia. It would have been much cheaper at that time than it will be today.*

*Pakistan should have a "real" democracy and in that the army had no role; all political parties and other forces, including the army, should discuss a viable solution to the issue.'*

The truth was that the superior judiciary had lost its respect due to the flaws in the judicial system and continuous interference of the executive. The security and justice were the main public welfare issues of Pakistan, but the judiciary had been going weak – not coping with the demands of the day. Even today, after decades the judiciary stands at the same lowest point of disillusionment and frustration as it started in August 1947.

The meaning of justice was to manoeuvre the judiciary to get a judgment in one's favour; Pakistan's successive army rulers and the PML[N] notoriously used it that way. The fact was that the politicians and the rich had no respect for the law.

Referring to 'Overview of corruption in Pakistan' Authored by Marie Chêne of Transparency International:

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

*'According to TI Pakistan's 2006 survey, 96 percent of the people who came in contact with the judiciary encountered corruption and 44 percent of them reported having to pay a bribe to a court official.*

*Again, according to Global Integrity, the procedure for selecting judges at the national level is not transparent and selection procedures are often made in exchange for political favours or on Chief Justice's whims.*

*Despite these problems, judges are exempt from oversight and investigations by Pakistan's national anticorruption agency [NAB].*

*The business community generally lacks confidence in the capacity of the judiciary to enforce rules and laws, and the settlement of disputes often involves paying bribes.'*

BITTER FACTS – BARE TRUTHS:

Benazir Bhutto took over the reigns of government in 1993 again and brought Farooq Leghari as the President of Pakistan. Mr Leghari was a staunch member of the PPP and had been amongst the top admirers of the Bhutto family. Whenever Ms Bhutto wanted the president for official job, she used to call him in her chamber or PM House.

During mid 1996, the relationship between PM Benazir Bhutto and President Leghari started deteriorating. Immediately the two personalities went sour with each other. During the last days, the situation arose that Benazir Bhutto had to go to the Presidency to see President Leghari and, in meetings, started discussing official matters while sitting in the lounge.

During discussions, Benazir Bhutto addressed the president saying *'Bhai [Brother] Leghari ....'* President Leghari immediately interrupted and said: *'Look Madam! It is a meeting between the President and a Prime Minister; avoid calling me Bhai and continue talking political issues...'*

Benazir Bhutto did not care and continued calling him *Leghari bhai*. Suddenly President Leghari left his seat and called his wife with a loud shout. When she joined them in the lounge, President Leghari smilingly said to her, *'your sister in law [exact word used was 'nand'] is here; have*

*a chat with her. I'm going in my office for an urgent official commitment.'*

ON BB'S INVESTIGATION: The Pakistani populace had clues that why the President Zardari, having PPP's elected governments in Islamabad and Karachi, could not get his wife Benazir Bhutto's assassination case investigated while remained in saddles for full five years. The PPP's media stalwarts at President House once sincerely pointed out the involvement of Gen Musharraf and the then Interior Secretary Syed Kamal Shah who had dangerously tried to twist the facts about BB's killing. A report published in *daily the 'Dawn'* dated *15<sup>th</sup> March 2011* is referred.

In the backdrop of the infamous press conference by Brig (rtd) Javed Iqbal Cheema on that murder [he was spokesman of the interior ministry at that time], revealed that:

*"The contents of the press conference were provided by Maj Gen Nusrat Naeem, the then Director General of the Counter - Intelligence Wing of ISI [DG CI], at a meeting held in the ISI HQ."*

Big (rtd) Cheema whose statement was recorded by the Joint Investigation Team [JIT], also added that:

*"...the said meeting was also attended by the then Interior Secretary, Syed Kamal Shah. I did not express any assumptions, guess work or opinion at the press briefing. I just reproduced what I was given to share with the media."*

At the press conference held on 28<sup>th</sup> December 2007, Brig (rtd) Cheema had presented an audio-tape of a conversation between Baitullah Mehsud and one '*Maulvi sab*' and told media reporters that the Chief of the *Tehrik e Taliban* Pakistan [TTP] was behind the murder.

In the latest challan [final report under S 173 CrPC] submitted to an Anti-Terrorism Court in Rawalpindi, paragraph 42 related to the subject was:

*"In this press conference the then DG, NCMC, not only announced the cause of death of Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto but also declared that the terrorists belonged to Baitullah Mehsud, chief commander of TTP. The credibility of investigation of this case was affected by the premature press conference."*

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

Interior ministry believed that Brig (rtd) Cheema had acted only on the instructions of his immediate boss Kamal Shah who accompanied him at the ISI HQ. They said the decision to address the press conference had been taken at a meeting held the same morning at the Rawalpindi camp office with the then President Gen Musharraf in the chair.

Brig (rtd) Ejaz Shah, the former Chief of Intelligence Bureau and a trusted aide to Gen Musharraf, confirmed in his statement, a copy of which was also available with the media that the meeting had been held. *"The intercepted CD and medical report was provided by the ISI. The briefing was given by DG-CI to the participants."*

The irony of fate remained that the PPP's government and its JIT had not interrogated Maj Gen Naeem, till ending 2011 at least, who was living in Rawalpindi and was then working with the Bahria Town Management.

KARACHI'S SPILL OVER:

In contemporary Pakistan, there have been less politics and more political gimmicks – mostly ending with shocks. Once in early May 2008, Mr Zardari, the co-chairperson of the PPP, himself threw a bomb shell by offering compromise with the PML[N] on the issue of reinstatement of defunct superior judges but then backed out declaring that *'political promises are not verses of Qua'an or Hadith'*.

Immediately after, the PML[N] retaliated by withdrawing its ministers from the cabinet. Mr Zardari did two more explosions then; by sending Gen Musharraf home in August 2008 and then nominating himself as president in his place.

In February 2009, the PPP launched another attack by sending PML[N] government home in Punjab but PML[N] succeeded in hitting the PPP with more intensity by launching a long march on 16<sup>th</sup> March facilitating Justice Iftikhar M Chaudhry and his fellow judges to be restored and reinstated in their original position.

CJP Iftikhar M Chaudhry's superior judiciary in turn discharged numerous bomb shells in the form of decisions on burning issues like 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2007's emergency, NRO, promotions of federal bureaucracy, un-ceremoniously but rightly sending Justice Deedar Hussain Shah home and termination of PCO judges etc to cite few of them.

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

On political front Maulana Fazalur Rehman's quit, thrice MQM's somersaults for leaving and re-joining the federal and provincial cabinets with the PPP and PML[Q]'s joining the PPP were enough to provide hot material for the serious historians.

The most damaging nuclear bomb shell, mirroring the ugliest face of Pakistani politics, was a series of press conferences of PPP's Dr Zulfiqar Mirza during 28-30<sup>th</sup> August 2011 in which he apparently targeted MQM & Rehman Malik but indirect smack had also caused dents, adventurism and doubts in PPP's own circles especially the President's fort.

Speaking frankly, Dr Mirza's whole speech was basically a staunch criticism over the policies of his own party PPP in the garb of Mr Zardari's friendship claims and old family relationship. No body was expecting this stabbing from the PPP's '*Brutus*', too.

*[A similar occasion was once seen during Gen Ayub's rule of 1960s when Gen Azam Khan, being his most trusted aide, was made Governor East Pakistan. He ruled that part of Pakistan in such a nice way that the East Pakistanis again started praising their western counterparts more than brothers.*

*When the people's liking for Gen Azam Khan crossed a certain limit, Gen Ayub Khan was briefed that latter's own existence was being threatened. Gen Ayub, putting aside the public sentiments of the Eastern Wing, had sent Gen Azam on retirement without assigning any reason. A chapter of hatred was opened from the top brass ranks then.*

*At this moment, one can recall Gen Ziaul Haq's first speech in mid 1977 as CMLA after taking Mr Bhutto in 'protective custody' from which even a layman could understand that it was a revolt. The General ruled for eleven years in an unprecedented move of the history.]*

One can also recall Nawaz Sharif's press speech of early 1993 immediately before the event when he was sent home. Prior to that speech Nawaz Sharif was generally taken as the PM sponsored by the '*Establishment*' but after that speech he was considered a grown-up politician. Even PPP's Benazir Bhutto had to say that '*now she would be facing a full grown political opponent*'.

Coming back; it was the time that Mr Zardari had to revisit his political strategy for Sindh because Dr Mirza had attracted most of the Sindhi youth

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

towards his person. Big landlords were feeling danger from him so definitely sided with Mr Zardari but a common man had taken enlightenment from Dr Mirza's truthfulness. Not only rural Sindhis but the peace loving Karachiites, whether Urdu speaking or not but feeling oppressed due to *Bhatta*, Land, Drug and ammunition mafias & gangs, aspired to go hand in hand with Dr Mirza.

During the later terms of both PPP and the PML[N], every Pakistani has been floating in a quagmire of confusion. Politics had gone a curse in this country. Truthful and liar faces had intermingled. People wanted a drop scene of stinking political dramas of loot and plunder in dithering 're-conciliation'. MQM also came forward with true answers. Press conferences by its '*Rabita Committees*' and discarding messages did not work in that charged atmosphere then; it was mid 2011.

Boycott of TV talk shows and going into silence zones could not win the people any more. For the PPP, simply accepting resignations of Dr Mirza was not enough. Mr Zardari was asked to come out with a solemn pledge and thorough enquiries over the issues raised by Dr Mirza through some judicial commission – but with no avail.

Great responsibility lied on the shoulders of army and judiciary to sort out truth from the allegations leveled by Dr Mirza. The Supreme Court was already proceeding with the *sou motu* action on Karachi affairs. Dr Mirza was called in the court to place the evidences on record which he had waved during the press conferences under reference – but Dr simply ignored the call from the SC bench.

Other political groups, ANP and MQM, approached the apex court with the request to treat them as 'party' to the issue because they were the stake holders. The solution was not far away had the institutions felt it as duty with a live conscientiousness; either the MQM and Rehman Malik could be washed away or Dr Mirza disappeared from the political scene for ever.

The nation desired to know the facts about the hidden hands of killers in Karachi.

*(...the above paragraphs were published at [www.Pakspectator.com](http://www.Pakspectator.com) on 2<sup>nd</sup> September 2011 under title 'Karachi's Spill Over')*

One Ali Hashim wrote in 'the News' dated 19<sup>th</sup> September 2013:

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

*'To an outsider, like myself, this MQM leader they talk about [referred to Altaf Hussain] does not appear to be anything special. His speeches are often rambling and off point. He bursts into song now and then, throws tantrums and uses the same rough language, like the other political leaders.*

*He [Altaf Hussain] talks about exploitation of the masses by feudal landlords and the well-to-do. All a rehash of the slogans we have heard before. The uproar in the media is part of a larger story for which we need to go back a few years.'*

KARACHI DEFINED BETTER:

One would definitely like to see the REAL Karachi through foreign reports.

Crime and Safety Report on Karachi, released on 11<sup>th</sup> June 2014 compiled by the US State Department for 2013 kept its warning in tact:

*'.....all US citizens to defer non-essential travel to Pakistan. Al-Qa'ida, Taliban elements, and other extremist organizations operate [still] actively inside Pakistan.*

*Karachi and other areas of Sindh and Balochistan provinces continue to experience high levels of violence characterized by bombings, targeted killings, sectarian strife, kidnappings for ransom, extortion, and frequent demonstrations. American citizens, US interests, and other Westerners are at risk of becoming targets of violence.'*

The said 'Crime and Safety Report' held that criminal gangs, often with political party affiliations, continued to operate with impunity in most parts of the city, and some areas were effectively cut off from police.

Despite a large-scale security operation carried out by Pakistani Rangers and Police, violent crime continued to rise that year, too and by many accounts 2013 was the deadliest year recorded in Karachi. The following 2013 Karachi crime statistics were based on data released by the Sindh Police and Rangers.

2,715 killed (civilians); 191 killed (police and Rangers); 125 killed (suspected criminals / terrorists); 108 kidnap-



The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

pings; 519 cases of extortion; 3,082 cases of robbery; 4,068 vehicle thefts; 22,284 motorcycle thefts; AND 10,501 cell phone thefts

The above figures did not include UNREPORTED / UN-REGISTERED cases for which the media holds that in Karachi only 30-40% cases are brought in books. The safest areas in Karachi remained the neighbourhoods referred to as Clifton, DHA and PECHS, but even these areas occasionally experienced serious crimes and thefts.

**Overall Road Safety Situation:** In Karachi, driving is chaotic and undisciplined. Intersections, both major and minor, often have non-working traffic lights. Poorly trained and unskilled drivers do not understand the concept of staying in lanes, turning etiquette, and use of mirrors. Driving outside the city at night is unsafe. Traffic is extremely heavy on weekdays, especially during normal commuting hours. Aside from the main arteries, roads are narrow, poorly-lit in many areas, and not well marked or maintained.

Vehicle accidents are common, and police generally do not respond to vehicle accidents, and there are no effective emergency medical response services. It is recommended to avoid all public transportation. For security reasons, foreign Consulate [*especially the American*] employees in Karachi are prohibited from using buses, taxis, rickshaws, or trains.

**Political, Religious and Ethnic Violence:** Pakistani Taliban [TTP] remained the most active terrorist organization even in Karachi and continued to demonstrate the capability to plan and execute major attacks.

Incidents of terrorism and politically motivated violence in Karachi and Sindh occurred with regular frequency. A variety of groups ranging from extremist religious elements to criminal gangs associated with local political organizations orchestrated bombings, assassinations, and other acts of violence with grim regularity, to include attacks on police and security forces.

NGOs and Polio vaccination programs were particularly singled out for attacks by the TTP. Since 2012 year, 33 workers associated with such programs were killed in the whole country. In 2013, there were seven reported attacks on polio vaccination drives in Karachi alone.

**Civil Unrest:** Political and sectarian civil unrest could erupt in Karachi at any time throughout residential and commercial areas of the city and quickly evolve into violent mobs. Strikes and transportation shut downs occurred frequently, often in reaction to sectarian violence, political interests, or in

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

protest of government policies. There were number of small anti-American demonstrations in 2013, but the overall numbers and size declined from 2012.

Police successfully demonstrated the capability to mobilize quickly and with force. Visitors were advised to avoid demonstrations, large crowds, and public gatherings that appeared to be political.

Religious or Ethnic Violence: Incidents of sectarian and ethnic violence in Karachi and in Sindh and Balochistan provinces continued unabated. A variety of groups representing extremist elements associated with Sunni and Shiite sects carried out bombings and assassinations in Karachi with grim regularity.

Minority religious sects and groups were also frequently targeted. In 2013, there were 128 reported incidents of sectarian violence in which 525 people were killed and 914 injured. These violent incidents often lead to retaliatory acts and demonstrations that went quickly spiral out of control.

*[On 24<sup>th</sup> September 2013; a magnitude 7.7 earthquakes struck the rural Awaran area in Balochistan, killing at least 825 people and destroying more than 21,000 homes. Lack of transportation infrastructure to the area, along with local apprehension of working with emergency authorities, contributed to Pakistan's difficulty in responding to the disaster.]*

Economic Espionage: Counterfeit movies and goods remained openly available in Karachi; however, the overall low level of disposable income did not generate high demand. Many garment factories often made supplies of counterfeits to local outlets, which sold them at a reduced price since they were not able to be exported.

Unauthorized access to personally identifiable information [PII] was quite frequent. Few holders of PII kept adequate safeguards and access controls to prevent dissemination of sensitive information.

Restricted Travel Zones: Roads in many parts of Sindh province are poorly maintained including Karachi, thus highway robbery and banditry were frequent occurrences, especially in areas where the government felt difficulty controlling.

Major areas of northern and eastern Karachi were not recommended for travel due to the frequency of criminal activity and neighbourhoods that

#### The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

were controlled by various criminal or political gangs or sympathetic to extremist religious organizations that were suspicious of, or hostile to, Westerners.

**Drug-related Crimes:** Drug-related mafias kept controlling parts of Karachi. Drug-related crimes were not well documented by police. While illicit drug use occurred, the knowledge of its frequency, type, and proliferation remained based mostly on anecdotal evidence.

**Kidnapping Threats:** Kidnapping has been a lucrative industry in Karachi and Sindh since many years. Criminal and extremist groups often targeted local businessmen and prominent families in order to extort ransoms for profit or to finance operations. Ransoms were often negotiated and paid by families without police notification or involvement.

US citizens and foreign and local employees of NGOs were targeted for kidnapping. Groups that perpetrated kidnappings were not frequently identified, caught or brought to justice. Vetting of personnel and proper personal security procedures remained key for avoiding this kind of crime.

**Police Response:** The police services always remained below the professional standards in whole of Pakistan and more in Karachi due to lack of training, resources and low salaries. The conduct of investigations, arrests, and prosecutions continued to go affected by local political influence.

The police had difficulty in responding to emergencies in many of the more violent areas of Karachi and were actively denied access to some neighbourhoods. Hostile and volatile areas remained the kingdoms of specific gangs.

**Incidents of Police Detention or Harassment:** All foreign citizens and travellers in Karachi and generally all Westerners were advised that if they would be arrested or detained by police, they would make no admissions, statements, or would sign documents.

**Medical Emergencies:** in Karachi, like Pakistan's common hospitals, care and cleanliness has always been below the any other nation's standards. Medical facilities required pre-payment. There has been no standard ambulance / emergency medical service in Karachi and no air ambulance except two charities – Edhi & Cheeba. All ambulance services could be considered merely as transportation without emergency medical personnel.

#### The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

Health Hazards: Water has never been potable in Karachi, and sanitation in many restaurants remained inadequate like outdoors in streets. Stomach illnesses remained common and were life-threatening for all. Vaccinations for Hepatitis A and B, Typhoid, Japanese encephalitis, Polio, and Rabies were always recommended but never been available even on prompt payments. Citizens were frequently advised to avoid street foods.

Avoiding Crimes / Scams: In Karachi, crimes and scams remained common, including cell phone theft, credit card fraud, and counterfeit money schemes – and like ever. All business travellers were advised to exercise maximum caution with investment and property transactions.

Many areas were recommended as off-limits to Western visitors in Karachi. Visitors were advised to not venture into any unknown areas and to limit their movements, especially after dark. Many areas in Karachi remained 'un-accessible' due to high crime, lack of police control, and the presence of extremist elements.

Business travellers in Karachi had to maintain a high level of situational awareness and caution at all times; used to notify someone of their location. They had to avoid time and place predictability, and were not to set established patterns through variable routes and times of departure. Most people knew primary and alternate routes to all destinations and ensuring locations with emergency exits.

General populace had to keep a low profile, avoid carrying large sums of cash or wear any jewellery. They used to leave wallets or purses secured at home while carrying only necessary cash and ID in a front pocket. Sensible and educated people always avoided politically or religiously active areas of the city; also high risk areas, crowds, and civil disturbances.

Hotels & Restaurants: most major hotels kept employed local security firms, which provided them adequate security. Fire fighting resources were severely lacking like ever, and the foreign travellers generally stayed on lower floors in hotel. No fire evacuation plans were available in the hotels even they were ranked five starred.

Now see a factual script in media pages; a truthful observation:

In Pakistan, decades of observation forced the historians to conclude that there is no temporary solution. A country had been brought to the brink of disaster by its own custodians in succession, only Gen Ayub and ZA Bhutto excluded. *Pakistanis never wanted change*, because a positive change

The Living History of Pakistan Vol-IV

would deny them the liberty of not following building plans, traffic rules, honesty in trade, business and ethical rules.

*Each Pakistani is responsible for this dilapidated situation of this country; they want rules to be applied to everyone else, except themselves. They break rules on the pretext that someone else has also done that. Look at traffic lights what is happening, look at their triumphs when they do encroachment for their houses and business.*

Long term solution is each one abiding by the rules without any exception. They do not train their next generation to follow rules; rather they break the rules in their presence on the pretext "*this is Pakistan - sab chalta hai*" [- everything is fair here].

Pakistanis must start self accountability and evaluate themselves as to how many times a day they have broken what laws, how many times they have offered bribe in order to take short cut, even for their legal jobs. *One should start good governance from his own person, then family, then.....*

One must congratulate the efforts of LEAs in Karachi and especially the Rangers for bringing the peace to this city after a while though there was still lot more to do yet; big fishes remained at large.

Ending this day's sermon with the famous words from Theodore Roosevelt, the American Statesman:

*"Here is your country. Cherish these natural wonders, cherish the natural resources, cherish the history and romance as a sacred heritage, for your children and your children's children. Do not let selfish men or greedy interests skin your country of its beauty, its riches or its romance."*

Inam R Sehri  
Manchester  
12<sup>th</sup> February 2017